NEGOTIATING BEAUTY
(MUSLIM WOMEN RESPONSE ON WHITENING BEAUTY PRODUCT)

Elya Munfarida *)

Abstract: *Kecantikan perempuan bukan sesuatu yang universal dan tidak berubah. Hal ini dibuktikan dengan adanya pergeseran konsepsi kecantikan perempuan, yang dulu diidentikkan dengan tubuh yang gemuk, sekarang lebih diidentikkan dengan tubuh yang langsing dan berkulit putih. Pergeseran konstruksi kecantikan ini tidak terlepas dari peran media yang merepresentasikan kecantikan perempuan dengan image tertentu, misalnya melalui iklan-iklan produk pemutih yang menggambarkan perempuan cantik adalah yang memiliki kulit putih. Dalam artikel ini, perempuan justru mengunakan agensi mereka untuk menegosiasi konsepsi kecantikan yang diidentikkan dengan kulit putih dan lebih menekankan penampilan fisik, dan merekonstruksi konsep kecantikan yang berbeda. Sebagai perempuan muslim, mereka meng-akomodir nilai-nilai agama yang lebih menekankan pada moralitas sebagai bagian dari inner beauty untuk mengkritik konsepsi kecantikan yang dire-presentasikan media yang semata-mata menekankan aspek fisik. Meskipun, penampilan fisik juga dianggap penting, namun moral yang baik dianggap lebih esensial. Dengan rekonstruksi ini, perempuan telah mengorganisir identitas yang berbeda, bahkan berlawanan, dalam narasi baru yang menjadi dasar bagi konstruksi habitus dan praktik kecantikan mereka di masa yang akan datang. **Kata-kata Kunci:** Kecantikan, Media, Representasi, Subjektivitas, Agensi.*

A. INTRODUCTION

Beauty is a theme that is as old as human being, for it is one of the ultimate values the human pursue beside truth and goodness.[1] The objects of beauty are many, such as nature, people, animal, plants, art works, and so on. However, one of the objects that attracts a great concern in human life is women beauty. The earliest story on it in Islamic tradition is a story of sons of Adam, Qabil and Habil, who were perceived as the first sinners for they killed each other to gain their beautiful sister. This story reveals the existence of beauty attached to woman. Instead, another

---

*) Penulis adalah dosen Jurusan Dakwah (Komunikasi) STAIN Purwokerto.

story of Prometheus and Epimetheus who competed for the beautiful Pandora, went on the same endings with Adam' sons. These stories exhibit, as Kierkegard says, the supreme value of beauty that all people pursue as one of the aesthetic way of life.[2]

The ultimate value attached to beauty results the continual concern of human on it throughout humankind history. Human history embeds within it a history of beauty, including the beauty of women. Such value also drives the people to attain it by any means, including as the stories mentioned above, doing harmful and violent things without considering the consequence. Given the overwhelming obsession for being beautiful, women tend to abide their rationality by undertaking any means including those that endanger their health and life. Sheila Jeffreys argues that beauty practices result harm and damage mostly for women health such as breast implant surgery, genital mutilation, cosmetic surgery and other practices which cause different extent of harm for women.[3] Ironically such practices are often legitimated by medical science and the state without considering the essensial effect of women life. Such consideration is left behind the demand of the market to sell its products.

Though beauty is regarded as universal that it has sensible relations coinciding with certain stages of aesthetic apprehension,[4] its conception will be differently articulated in different times and places. Dealing with women beauty, for instance, there is a shifting conception of what a beautiful woman is. Naomi Wolf asserts: "Beauty" is not universal or changeless, though the West pretends that all ideals of female beauty stem from one Platonic Ideal Woman; the Maori admire a fat vulva, and the Padung, droopy breasts".[5] The change of beauty can be discerned through the shifting of the desired women body from the ancient time that preferred to overweight women for it shows the reproductive capacity to the current time that conversely prefers the thin one.[6]

Instead, we as well find image of beauty attached to white skin. Light-skinned is equated with beauty and conceived as more beautiful than the dark one. Thus the latter is pressured to change its color by using whitening or lightening beauty products. As Bonny Berry shows, in worldwide, there is a phenomenal growth in the avalaibility and number of skin-lightening products used in India, Africa, Asia, and the United States.[7] As we see on the media, almost all beauty brands promote

lightening products as their main commodities. Even illegal whitening products are ubiqutious that are mostly consumed by especially the low class. Though the effect is harmful, that there is no cosmetic which actually can change the skin color naturally, if it can, there must be unnaturally by which can cause danger for health and life, it does not impede women to use whitening beauty products.

This phenomena reveals a significant thing that being white as an equation of beauty is really desired by most women and frequently connected with success both in love and work, as implied in advertaisment "Pond's Fair and Lovely", which Berry calls it as "result of a social pairing of fairer complexions with beauty and success".[8] This tendency is also supported by a research toward 1.000 students of Senior High School in al-Azhar, Jakarta that most of them agree of the skin beauty conception offered by Pond's White Beauty.[9] This result seems to regard those students only taken for granted the image presented in media which in turn deny their agency and negotiation to that image. As such, in this paper I will argue that negotiation always involve in the process of internalizing the conception offered by media especially on white-associated beauty. Differently, I take muslim women as the respondents to know whether religious consideration is evolved in defining and negotiating beauty. To reach this thesis, some questions are necessary to arise. How the Muslim women define their own beauty concept amidst media advertaisments that mostly represent beauty as being white or light-skinned? How do they involve religious considerations to negotiate that beauty construct?

B. MEDIA, REPRESENTATION AND SUBJEC-TIVITY

Marshal Mc Luhan in *Understanding Media: The Extensions of Man*, convinces of positive role media play for the development of humankind history. Given development of sophistichated technology and information unable people throughout the world live in "a global village" in which all events and informations happen in whole world can be seen and experienced by them.[10] In similar line, George Gebner holds that media has become a new religion of industrial (and postindustrial) society.[11] As a religion, it provides teachings manifested in the content of the

offered programs, audience as its fellows, and force of mobilization. As such, media is considered as having a significant contribution on providing informations and simultaneously inculcating its values in people consciousness. This view percepts media and its information and values as neutral and objective, hence productive for enhancing the quality of humanity.

The objective role of media is currently being critisized by a stream of media studies that indeed breaks the previous positive and objective opinion of media and emphasize the existing ideology of media in representing reality.[12] Thus the represented reality is not neutral and objective rather distorted through selective construction in áccordance to the dominant social power. As expressed by Stuart Hall, media, including television, effects on constructing selectively social knowledge, social imagination through which we percept the world, the reality underwent by other people and imaginatively reconstruct their lives and our lives.[13] In a sense, media serves as social and cultural sources that provide meanings, values, interpretations, perspectives and practices as a means for people to discern and percept the reality, the world and their identity. As such, what we are and how we perform are crucially determined by media construct. Media, in this stance, is thus significant for social and cultural production and reproduction.

The significance of media can be further elaborated through concept of representation. M.H. Abrams depicts shifting in Western discourse on representation using two metaphors to describe two stages of approaches of representation: first, mirror metaphor constituting idea that mind reflects outer world (mimetic approach). Human mind is capable to represent reality or world without any distortion. Mind in this conception is conceived as passive and thus only reproductive. Second, lamp metaphor that mind radiates its light to the object it looks at (anti-mimetic approach). This conception regards mind as having active and creative image. However, the development of critical and cultural studies has generated crisis of reperesentation that word, sentence, description as representation do not always have any relation with the reality they represent.[14] Influenced by theory of semiology introduced by Saussure, meaning is not referential that it relates to the reference or reality, rather it stems from difference. This view points that word as representation

of a reality does not inherently constitute in the reality itself. Representation does not intrinsictly reflect the reality. In consequence, representation has unlimited representational content depending on the perspective and context.

Every form of representation is regarded as product of culture in which it involves system of belief of the culture, the cultural interpretations of reality and ways the culture translates factual and fictional situations into images.[15] Every representation can be considered as a text or a sign. Thus, representation signifies meanings, values, beliefs that the culture attaches to it. In other word, representation is also a means habitus disposes individual to certain practices. Perceptions, evaluations, appreciations and knowledges are manifestations of representation by which individuals are disposed in certain social positions and behave according to what the habitus demands and requires.[16] It is the cultural involvement that representation then is perceived as natural and commonsensical, thus, unquestionable. It becomes something that has to be taken for garanted by the members of community resulting that deviating from the established representation will be regarded as violating the cultural convention.

In other word, representation is also ideological and interested that it is constructed based on the ideology and interest of the producer. Ideology as structure of signification or worldview that creates social relations in and through exercising power,[17] determines mode of representation and its signification. It is as well interest that disposes agents to act in certain ways. "Interest is what makes the reproduction of the original habitus somewhat more likely, the easiest path for events to fall into in the usual course of things".[18] Both views regard representation is a means to maintain practices and habitus of certain ideology and interest, and naturalize them as a commonsense. However, in recent media studies, the ideological structuration of representation is to be main concern to reveal ideological force behind it. Critical judgement of representation needs to bring into fore through denaturalization of cultural images and institiutionalized reactions of the images.[19]

Issue on representation is inevitably connected with subjectivity, as it disposes subjects in certain social position and particular ways appropiate with their position. Foucault points out that subjectivity is

discursive product. Systems of power produce subjects by regulating their lifes through the limitation, prohibition, regulation, control, or even protection of individuals related to the political structure. These regulated subjects are formed, defined, and reproduced in accordance with the requirements of those structures.[20] In *The History of Sexuality*, for instance, Foucault focuses on controlling forms of disciplining subjects on their sexuality.[21] As such, Foucault rejects the notion of a sovereign subjectivity[22] that subjects are the author of what they says without any reference *in cognito*. Otherwise, the speaking subjects are defined according to the principle of discursive regularity, which distributes and disperses subjects across a variety of sites and positions within a discourse.[23]

Foucault view on subjectivity provides an useful device to comprehend that social order is formed by discourse of power yielding subjects in accordance with it that create and reproduce that order. However, subjects of Foucault seem to be very determinated by discursive power that have no agency to reflectivily critisize the existing dominant power. Theory of structuration of Anthony Giddens seeks to fill the concept of agency. This theory evokes that it is the social structure the actors derive their resources and competence. Social structure thus determines and structurizes what the actors should be and should perform. Though social production and reproduction the actors take are socially determined, this production and reproduction are performed through their own actions.[24]

To deal with the problem of agency of the self, Dorothy Holland, etc., propose the heuristic development of identity and agency that directs its attention to two processes: 1) the genesis of the products (improvisations) that come from the meeting of persons, cultural resources, and situations in practice; and 2) the appropiation of these products as heuristics for the next moment of activity. This view is conceptualized in term "figured worlds" consisting some notions. First, figured worlds are historical phenomena to which we are recruited or into which we enter, which themselves develop through the works of their participants. Second, figured world, like activities, are social encounters in which participants' positions matter. Third, figured world are socially organized and reproduced institutional sense. They divide

and relate participants, and they depend upon interaction and inter-subjectivity for perpetuation. Fourth, figured worlds distribute "us", not only by relating actors to the landscape of actions and spreading our senses of self across many different fields of activity, but also by giving the landscpae human voice and tone.[25] Figured worlds then provide a means to conceptualize historical subjectivities, consciousnesses and agency, persons (and collective agents) forming in practice. This concept has included the two seemingly contradictive notions between humans as social producers and as social products. Indeed, both notions interrelate each other and construct the history of humans which never be static and always changes time to time.

Given de-centrings of subjects evoked by postmodernism, for Hall, subjects are no longer perceived as unified individual and fully centred, otherwise, they are fragmented, decentred, composed, not of a single, but of several, sometimes contradictory and unresolved identities.[26] As such, in contemporary era, we have several different identities simul-taneously based on religion, ethnicity, nation, and other identities which eventually or frequently contradict each other. The question arises is can these different identities be resolved? Allison Weir holds that indi-vidual has reflective capacity and responsbility to problematize one's own meaning or identity as a priviledge of modern subject. But in other hand, the increasing need for self-definition goes an increasing production and differentiation of identity-attributes: of possible roles, attachments and affiliations, values, beliefs and commitments, needs and desires, styles, mode of expressions.[27] Among its diverse identity, cognitive capacity is required to reflect on who I am and what matters to me, to organize these diverse identities and identity-attributes into some sort of meaningful narrative or constellation. Instead, practical capacity is required to discover and define what matters to me, while remaining flexible and open to change.[28] Weir's opinion asserts the individual capacity to resolve the different and even conflicting identities within one subject or among different subjects in society, and fit them in a meaningful narration. However, this narration is not something fixed but open to change if more meaningful narration need to be created. This opinion affirms of the agency of subject to create its own historical narrative amidst social and cultural determinism.

C. MUSLIM WOMEN NEGOTIATE BEAUTY

Media construct on beauty mostly using white or light skinned women as the model represents beauty as being white. As a representation, it certaintly does not reflect the reality of beauty and women experience of beauty itself. Stacy Malkan writes: "We're bombarded with advertisements like that every day. Every beauty product in the Philippines has a lightening aspect. Even lipstick promises to make dark upper lips more pink," said Anne Larracas from Quezon City near Manila.[29] As described by Stuart Ewen on the history of beauty, it can be obviously discerned how social beliefs, expectations and structures effect on the construct of beauty.[30] This fact suggests that representation of beauty is not referential and thus universal, but it is more related to social determinations.

Media greatly contributes a decissive role to create social knowledge on beauty by which women uses it to perceive their body and their beauty. The execessive internalization of media creates a significant effect on women's perception on beauty itself. A research toward 1.000 students of Senior High School in al-Azhar, Jakarta points that most of them agree of the skin beauty conception offered by Pond's White Beauty.[31]

In addition, all five respondents I interviewed, in different extent, were influenced by beauty images offered by whitening beauty products that are exposed in media. Tanti (20) and Windi (22) stated that they were being influenced by media advertaisment on whitening product and used it, but since they got iritation on their skin they decided not to use it anymore. While Isti (19) and Fatimah (20) also being influenced and remained to use whitening product. Septi (19) were also being influenced but she was not dare to use it, afraid of being harmful for her skin. In result, some women, such as Fatimah and Windi, admitted that white or light-skinned were one factor of being perceived as beautiful. While the other sought to negotiate that being white was not directly beautiful depending on whether they are good-looking or not. This result reveals that media construct, dealt with white skin, has shaped values of beauty internalized by the women as a part of their values to reproduce in their social practices. Effect of media construct not only in cognitive level, but also in practical one that they seeks to

use it to attain what the media represent it. Even some took a risk of being irritated to fit the beauty representation in media.

Representation of beauty as being white also disposes women in certain social positions and behave according to what habitus of beauty demands and requires. Construct of beauty that emphasize in physical appearance, light-skinned, is regarded by women as an important thing for making and succedding relationship. Septi, for instance, conceived that physical apperance is important for enhancing self confidence. While Isti argued that good appearance was necessary for making relationship with other people. Isti said: "If we feel comfortable with our appearance, the surrounding people will feel the same way too". These statement seems to reinforce habitus of beauty that emphasizes on physical appearance. Good appearance is then related to succeed in uplifting self confidence and in making relationship. In Foucault term, subjects of women are formed by discourse of beauty power that yields subjects in accordance with it to create and reproduce the order of beauty.

Rather than taken for granted of media representation, the women indeed possess cognitive capacity to critisize the existing representation of beauty. Cases of Tanti and Windi shows this tendency that they started to stop using whitening products because of its harmful result that iritated their skins. Isti had different experience that though she used whitening product but she believed that it could not make her skin being light or white. She kept to use it not for whitening her skin but just for being clear. Reflective capacity is used here to prevent harmful effects that can likely occur as they use whitening products.

Regarding the concept of beauty stressing on good appearance, some considers that good appearance is not merely physical as such, but it is generated from well psychical quality. Windi said: "good morality will be reflected on the physical appearance". The similar comment comes from Tanti, "Though a woman is physically good appearance, morally bad, she is deemed as not beautiful or less beautiful". Likewise, referring to religious discourse, Fatimah held: "In religion, beauty refers much to morality. If the morality of woman is good, it will generate a charisma. Though she is not good-looking, but morally good, she will look charismatic". These responses suggest that notion of beauty on physical appearance tends to be connected to psychical quality to determine the real beauty. It also implies that interpretation of the importance of

physical appearance proposed by the habitus of beauty in media, is not taken for granted, but it is critisized by involving another value they have, that is, morality proposed by religion.

The critical attitude of those women exhibits the agency they have, that they do not perceive beauty construct as a commonsense and the only truth, but denaturalizes it by adding another value, that is religious one, regarded as the most essensial to define beauty. All the respondents agreed in different extents that beauty is not merely in physical but more in morality. They stress on the so-called inner beauty range from intellectuality and mostly good morality as defined by religion. Generally speaking, they combine religious values that emphasize on moral quality and media or even social values that stress on physical quality. Both views seems contradictory since physical and psychical are in opposition. But the different identities they possess simulatneously urge them to reconcile both values to generate a new value as a perspective to discern reality and to produce, not only reproduce, their social practices.

The responses of the women above also reveal that the improvisations they commit are based on the existing structures, that is, social structure represented in media and as well religious structure represented in morality. Both becomes cultural sources from which they get words, meanings and interpretations to comprehend beauty concept. Thus, they make signification on beauty not merely based on single discursive structure but more than one. It indeed provide them more perspective to involve within their making decision of defining and negotiating the prevailing dominant discourse of beauty mostly attached to physical apperance, that is, white-skinned.

Another thing significant to consider is social positions they occupy, that is, as students of an Islamic university. This factor also effect on the way they formulate their subjectivities in deal with beauty concept. The need to create network of relation demand them to adopt the existing social norms and values including those represented in media to gain successful relationship. However, as their social positions are not just in a single kind of community, but also belong to another one, such as religious community, these multiple social positions drive them to adopt values, norms and dispositions attached to those positions. Being students of Islamic university, in turn lead them to accommodate religious

values in the constructing process of their subjectivities as religious fellows.

The subjectivity resulted from the different and eventually contradictory identities is the way they resolve the problem identity they face. Rather then being unresolved, they decide to incorporate them in a new construction of identity that unable them to perform both of them simultaneously. It also becomes the effective and fair way to treat both of them in balance. This stance will keep them in attachment to both identities and not to alienate of themselves from both. In this sense, they have as agencies reflective capacity to problematize both their own religious and social identity in terms of beauty concept by critisizing them. Physical beauty without inner beauty is not complete, otherwise, inner beauty also need to pay attention on physical beauty, for religion also affirm of physical apperance, but not in priority. By putting them in a new identity or mixed identity, they have organized these diverse identity into a meaningful narration that will underlie their habitus of beauty or the next moment of their beauty practices.

D. CONCLUSION

The media construct of beauty as related to white or light skinned has effected on women definition of beauty. Though not all of my respodents affirms white skin as the highest manifestation of beauty, the emphasis on physical apperance that media internalizes, has significantly influenced their perspective of beauty. They aggree that physical apperance is important for enhancing self confidence and making a successful relationship. This view seems to support the beauty discourse exposed in media which relate beauty with succesfull relationship. However, they do not perceive what media represent on beauty as a commonsense and thus take it for granted. Using their cognitive capacities, they criticizes the only emphasis on physical apperance. For them, good morality is as important as or even more important than physical apperance. In this stance, they uses another value, that is religious one, to critisize the existing beauty discourse by offering another point of view. Though, both values seems to contradict, they could reconcile them by affirming the importance of both of them through defining beauty in different way.

This new concept as a form of improvisation shows the agency they perform amidst social and cultural determinism imposed by media. They uses religious values to counter and make balance on the beauty concept. By so doing, they could keep to live in both identities and not to aliante from them. Instead, by putting them in a new identity or mixed identity, they have organized these diverse identity into a meaningful narration that will underlie their habitus of beauty or the next moment of their beauty practices.

ENDNOTES

[1] Roger Scruton, *Beauty* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009), p. 2.

[2] *Ibid.*, p. 3.

[3] Sheilla Jeffreys, *Beauty and Misoginy: Harmful Cultural Practices in the West* (London & New York: Routledge, 2005), p. 30-31.

[4] There is differentiation between truth and beauty appeals. Truth appeals is related to the intellect through the intelligible, he says, as intellection; beauty appeals through the sensible not to the body, but to the imagination as aesthetic apprehension. He goes on to explain how the Thomist principles of wholeness (*integritas*), proportion (*consonitas*), and clarity (*claritas*) combine to give the apprehension of beauty, and that the effect of this is the essence of art, "the luminous, silent stasis of aesthetic pleasure," and this he calls the "enchantment of the heart." James Joyce, *Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* (London: Chancellor Press, 1993), p. 213, as quoted by Brian Garsom, "Beauty, Truth, and Alterity: Beyond Cause and Effect", in Anna Teresa Tyeminiecka (Ed.), *Beauty's Appeal: Measure and Excess* (Netherlands: Springer, 2008), p. xiii.

[5] Naomi Wolf, *The Beauty Myth: How the Image of Beauty is Used Against Women*, (New York: HarperCollins, 2002), p. 12.

[6] Stuart Ewen, *All Consuming Images: the Politics of Style in Contemporary Culture*, (The United States of America: Basic Books, Inc., 1988), p. 182.

[7] Bonny Berry, *Beauty Bias: Discrimination and Social Power*, (The United States of America: Praeger, 2007), p. 66.

[8] *Ibid.*

[9] Lintang Putri, "Rekonstruksi Soal Wacana Cantik", in *Suara Merdeka*, Thursday, 21 April 2011.

[10] Yasraf Amir Piliang, *Dunia Yang Dilipat: Tamasya Melampaui Batas-Batas Kebudayaan*, (Jakarta: Jalasutra, 2004), hal. 198-199.

[11] Jalaluddin Rahmat, *Islam Aktual*, (Bandung: Mizan, 1992), hal. 53-55.

[12] Stuart Hall summarizes the break undertaken by media studies in four aspects. First, it broke with the models of direct influence into a framework which drew more on the

"ideological" role of media. Second, it challanged the notions of media text as 'trasparent' bearers of meaning and gave much greater stress on linguistic and ideological structuration rather then content analysis. Third, it broke the passive audience replaced by the more active audience, and payed attention on 'reading' and relation between how media messages were encoded, the 'moment' of the encoded text and the variation of the audience 'decodings'. Fourth, the relation of media and ideology in turn lead to concern with the role media play in the circulation and securing of dominant ideological definitions and representation". Stuart Hall, "Introduction of Media Studies at the Centre", in Stuart Hall, Dorothy hobson, Andrew Lowe and Paul Willis, *Culture, Media, Language* (New York: Routledge, 1996). p. 117-118.

[13] Chris Barker, *Cultural Studies: Teori dan Praktek* (Yogyakarta: Kreasi Wacana, 2009). p. 275.

[14] Dani Cavallaro, *Critical and Cultural Theory: Teori Kritis dan Teori Budaya* (Yogyakarta: Niagara, 2004), p. 70-71.

[15] *Ibid.,* 74-75.

[16] Tony Thwaites, Lloyd Davis, and Warwick Mules, *Introducing Cultural and Media Studies* (London: Palgrave, 2002), p. 203.

[17] Chris Baker, *Cultural Studies*, p. 277.

[18] Tony Twhaites, etc., *Introducing*, p. 203.

[19] Dani Cavallaro, *Critical and Cultural Theory*, p. 74.

[20] Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* (London and New York, Routledge, 1999), p. 4.

[21] There were four strategies used since Victorian century to regulate sexuality. First, hysterization of women body as a strategy of restraining women sexuality for being conceived as "over filled by sexuality". Second, pedagogization of children sexuality that construct children as pursuing their sexual drives and therefore amoral and dangerous. Third, socialization of procreative behavior as a means to empower social body. Fourth, psychiatrization of the competing pleasures by constructing a corrective technology for treating deviant behaviors. Dani Cavallaro, *Critical and Cultural Theory*, p. 165-166.

[22] The sovereign subject or individual with his/her wants, needs, desires and interests is the main figure of in the discourses of both modern economics and the law. Stuart Hall, " The question of Cultural Identity", in Stuart Hall, David Held and Tony McGrew, *Modernity and Its Futures* (London: the Open University, 1999), p. 284.

[23] Chris Weedon, Andrew Tolson, and Frank Mort, "Theories of Language and Subjectivity", in Stuart Hall, Dorothy Hobson, Andrew Lowe and Paul Willis, *Culture, Media*, p. 211.

[24] Chris Barker, *Cultural Studies*, p. 189.

[25] Dorothy Holand, William Lachicotte, Debra Skinner and Carole Cain, *Identity, Agency in Cultural World* (London: Harvard University Press, 1998), p. 40-41.

[26] Hall, "The Question of Cultural Identity", p. 285-290.

[27] Allison Weir, "Toward a Model of Self-Identity: Habermas and Kristeva", in Johanna Meehan (Ed.), *Feminists Read Habermas: Gendering the Subject of Discourse* (New York & London: Routledge, 1995), p. 264.

[28] *Ibid.*, p. 265-266.

[29] Stacy Malkan, *Not Just a Pretty Face: The Ugly Side of the Beauty Industry* (Canada: New Society Publishers, 2007), p. 66.

[30] Ewen, *All Consuming*, p. 176-184.

[31] Lintang Putri, "Rekonstruksi Soal Wacana Cantik", in *Suara Merdeka*, Thursday, 21 April 2011.

REFERENCE

Barker, Chris. 2009. *Cultural Studies: Teori dan Praktek.* Yogyakarta: Kreasi Wacana.

Berry, Bonny. 2007. *Beauty Bias: Discrimination and Social Power.* The United States of America: Praeger.

Butler, Judith. 1999. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity.* London and New York, Routledge.

Cavallaro, Dani. 2004. *Critical and Cultural Theory: Teori Kritis dan Teori Budaya.* Yogyakarta: Niagara.

Ewen, Stuart. 1988. *All Consuming Images: the Politics of Style in Contemporary Culture.* The United States of America: Basic Books, Inc.

Garsom, Brian. 2008. "Beauty, Truth, and Alterity: Beyond Cause and Effect", in Anna Teresa Tyeminiecka (Ed.). *Beauty's Appeal: Measure and Excess.* Netherlands: Springer.

Hall, Stuart. 1996. "Introduction of Media Studies at the Centre", in Stuart Hall, Dorothy hobson, Andrew Lowe and Paul Willis. *Culture, Media, Language.* New York: Routledge.

————. 1999. "The Question of Cultural Identity", in Stuart Hall, David Held and Tony McGrew. *Modernity and Its Futures.* London: the Open University.

Holand, Dorothy. William Lachicotte, Debra Skinner and Carole Cain. 1998. *Identity, Agency in Cultural World.* London: Harvard University Press.

Jeffreys, Sheila. 2005. *Beauty and Misoginy: Harmful Cultural Practices in the West.* London & New York: Routledge.

Joyce, James. 1993. *Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man.* London: Chancellor Press.

Lintang Putri, "Rekonstruksi Soal Wacana Cantik", in *Suara Merdeka*, Thursday, 21 April 2011.

Malkan, Stacy. 2007. *Not Just a Pretty Face: The Ugly Side of the Beauty Industry.* Canada: New Society Publishers.

Piliang, Yasraf Amir. 2004. *Dunia Yang Dilipat: Tamasya Melampaui Batas-Batas Kebudayaan.* Jakarta: Jalasutra.

Rahmat, Jalaluddin. 1992. *Islam Aktual.* Bandung: Mizan.

Scruton, Roger. 2009. *Beauty.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Thwaites, Tony. Lloyd Davis, and Warwick Mules. 2002. *Introducing Cultural and Media Studies.* London: Palgrave.

Weedon, Chris. Andrew Tolson, and Frank Mort. 1996. "Theories of Language and Subjectivity", in Stuart Hall, Dorothy Hobson, Andrew Lowe and Paul Willis, *Culture, Media, Language.* New York: Routledge.

Weir, Allison. 1995. "Toward a Model of Self-Identity: Habermas and Kristeva", in Johanna Meehan (Ed.). *Feminists Read Habermas: Gendering the Subject of Discourse.* New York & London: Routledge.

Wolf, Naomi. 2002. *The Beauty Myth: How the Image of Beauty is Used Against Women.* New York: HarperCollins.